

Syllabus Pols 330-01 *Classical Political Theory*
Class Meets DBH 207 MWF 9:15- 1020
Instructor Professor William P. Collins
Hours DBH 107: 10-11AM - by appointment-

Texts

Plato **The Gorgias; Republic**
Aristotle **Categories; Ethics; The Rhetoric; Politics**
Lucretius **On the Nature of Things**
Cicero **On the Ideal Orator**

Class Policies and Format

Attendance is required and roll will be taken
Class format is lecture and discussion
I present a lecture with a handout for the next period
The handout is used for the class discussion period following the lecture
The course has 5 sections and a quiz follows each section
The quizzes are short answer, essay and questions are drawn from the handouts
The 5 quizzes count 60% of the total grade
A Final counts 40% and will be given Dec. 12, 8AM in this room
Make up exams can only be given for authorized absences

Course Outline

Section One: **Setting the Stage for Plato's Republic**
We read Plato's *Gorgias*. There are 5 sessions (quiz = 6%)

Section Two **Plato's Republic On the Nature of the Good and How It Is Found**

There are 11 sessions for studying Plato's *Republic* (quiz =s 17%)

Section Three: **Developing the Tools For Political Analysis** (quiz =s 10%)
We examine the foundations of Aristotle's approach to politics There are 7 sessions

Section Four **Understanding the Character of Community Life** (quiz =17%)
We study principles found in Aristotle's *Politics* There are 11 sessions

—

Section Five: **From City State to Empire: Redefining the Character of Politics**
(quiz= 10%)

We study the contribution of the Epicureans and Stoics. There are 7 sessions

Classical Political Theory

Section One **SETTING THE STAGE FOR PLATO'S REPUBLIC**

Lecture One **** Introduction to The Gorgias ****

Assignment **The Gorgias Pp. 19 -41**

=====

Lecture Outline

- Course Introduction
- Background for Reading **Gorgias**
- Introduction to **Gorgias**
- Organization of **Gorgias**

Course Introduction

- What is Political Philosophy?
- What is the Subject Matter of Classical Political Philosophy?
- How Will We Study the Subject?

Background for Reading Gorgias

- The Greek City State
- Describing the Social Dynamics
- From Epic to Logic: The Impact of the Sophists

--

Introduction to Gorgias

- The Dialogue Form
- The Problem For Gorgias
- Why the Problem Changes

--

Organization of Gorgias

- Brief Prelude
- Socrates and Gorgias
- Socrates and Polus
- Socrates and Callicles

Epilogue

Classical Political Philosophy

Section One: SETTING THE STAGE FOR PLATO'S REPUBLIC

Handout One: ***Introduction to *Gorgias***

Background for The Gorgias

In preparation for the discussion section come to class having information concerning the biographies of (1) Plato (2) Socrates and (3) Gorgias

--

Further you should develop some knowledge of (1) the Sophists and their role in Athenian life (2) the character of the Athenian democracy and its institutions (3) the nature and outcome of the Peloponnesian War

=====

Questions From The Gorgias

You should have some sort of answer for each these questions. These answers are a measure of how effectively you have understood the ideas being expressed. If you experience a difficult time bring your questions to the discussion session. This is very important because, once again, the end of the section quizzes will draw their questions from these lists.

***The Prelude**

[1] What mistake did Polus make in response to the question asked of him? [21-22]

=====

***Socrates and Gorgias**

[1] What is wrong with saying simply rhetoric is about speaking? [23-24]

[2] Why are astronomy and arithmetic not rhetoric? Why is that important? [25-26]

[3] When Gorgias says rhetoric concerns convincing people about right and right what new element has been introduced into the discussion? [29-30]

[4] What is Socrates' purpose in distinguishing between belief and knowledge? How does this distinction lead to a definition of the orator's craft? [32]

[5] What is Gorgias view abt the power of rhetoric, and his view concerning the teacher's role in the instruction of rhetoric? [34-35]

[6] What does Gorgias finally say when asked if the orator actually knows the good? How does this lead to the conclusion “the orator will never do wrong?” [35-41]

[7] What has now been learned about the character of rhetoric?

Classical Political Theory

Section One SETTING THE STAGE FOR PLATO’S REPUBLIC

Lecture One ****Introduction to the Gorgias****

Notes For: **Organization of Gorgias**

The Five Parts

Prelude

Socrates and Gorgias

Socrates and Polus

Socrates and Callicles

Epilogue

--

Prelude

*The Setting and Occasion for the Dialogue

* The Distinction Between a Judgement of Value and a Knowledge of What Something Is [21-22]

Socrates and Gorgias

* The Definition of Rhetoric

(1) There are five definitions of rhetoric put forward in this conversation. In general terms they move from a definition based on ‘subject matter’ to the final definition which states rhetoric involves no more than the “ignorant speaking to the ignorant” The intellectual movement is always toward reaching a precise definition Our goal as readers is to understand how Plato has been able at the end of the conversation between Gorgias and Socrates to move from a discussion focused on reaching a definition of rhetoric to the wider problem of what sort of knowledge is involved in being able to live a good life.

-

(2) **Definition One** (23-24) Rhetoric is simply about “speaking” This is an approach based on defining something by its subject matter. The definition fails here because if this were the definition, there would apparently be as many different kinds of rhetoric as there are subject matters depending upon speaking.

--

(3) **Definition Two** (24-25) Rhetoric is now defined as a particular kind of method. As Gorgias puts it “ This is why I assert that the art of oratory is the art of speech - par excellent- and I maintain that I am right” (24) Socrates approaches this definition by distinguishing among the various arts according to the manner in which they make use of speech. There are arts *which use no speech and are all action; * there are arts which are all speech and no action, *there are

arts where speech is required for action. Socrates then shows, “ If oratory is the art which achieves its effects by means of speech - arithmetic would be oratory.” Arithmetic however achieves its effects by calculation, not by oratory, it has its own approach (25)
This result reveals that the definition of oratory must be more restrictive. it does not encompass every possible subject matter

*Definition of Rhetoric (contd)

(4) **Definition Three:**[26-28] Socrates presses Gorgias(26) “ What is it that forms the subject of all speech that oratory employs?” Gorgias comes back with a rather pompous definition –“The greatest and best of human concerns, Socrates” [26] Socrates dispenses with it fairly easily with a bit of rhetoric himself. There are clearly many types human concerns and which one does Gorgias offer? As before, the definition of rhetoric Socrates asks that the definition move from a general sort of answer to something more specific

-
(5) **Definition Four** [28-30] Gorgias finally seems ready to narrow the definition. Typically, he starts with a value judgment. Rhetoric produces the greatest blessing, it gives freedom to the individual, and a power of ruling over others. “ I mean the ability to convince by means of speech, a jury in a court of justice, members of the council in their chamber, voters at the meeting of the assembly, and any other gathering of citizens” This definition is too general, rhetoric is not the only art which produces conviction. What sort of conviction does rhetoric produce?.

—
(6) **Definition Five** [31-32] A final definition is reached, one which will open the door for the consideration of the larger theme of the dialogue. “ Oratory, serves Socrates, to produce the kind of conviction needed in courts of law and other large assemblies, and the subject of this kind of conviction is right and wrong.” [30-31]

Socrates introduces a distinction: The Distinction Between *Belief and Knowledge*.

The

feature which distinguishes the terms is that beliefs are subject to error knowledge is not. Socrates says further [31] “ Yet men ,may just as properly be called convinced as men who know” “Thus orators do not teach juries and other bodies abt right and wrong * he merely persuades them; he could hardly teach so large a number of people matters of such importance in such a short time” [31] The implication of this result is that the orator does not have the necessary knowledge to produce true conviction. Orators must yield to those who know, since their province is only belief

*Gorgias’ Fatal Admission

(1) **Gorgias on the Power of Rhetoric** [34-35] In a striking speech Gorgias claims that rhetoric is all powerful because it can persuade people to move toward given ends.

—
(2) **Gorgias’ Moral Disclaimer** [35] On the other hand Gorgias claims that he has no control over how the speech might be used and goes further by saying no teacher of rhetoric should be blamed for a student who defends bad causes

—

(3) **Socrates on the Power of Rhetoric** [38] The orator has no knowledge of the truth of things, it is enough for him to have a knack of convincing the ignorant that he knows more than the experts. Socrates however, gets Gorgias to admit that he has to teach morals and that if he does teach morals the orator can neither speak anything but the truth nor act anyway but truthfully [41]

(4) **On the Idea That To Know the Good is to Do the Good** This idea originates from the Greeks' view that one is judged by their actions not by their intentions. The question will become, what sort of knowledge makes a man morally good?

Classical Political Theory

Section One

SETTING THE STAGE FOR PLATO'S REPUBLIC

Lecture Two

Analyzing Gorgias

Notes For:

Organization of Gorgias (pt.2)

The Five Parts

Prelude

Socrates and Gorgias

Socrates and Polus

Socrates and Callicles

Epilogue

Socrates and Polus

***The Issue of Shame**

Polus shows how Socrates has come to his result. Gorgias is ashamed to admit the orator does not teach the right and the just. That admission contradicts Gorgias' earlier claim that he teaches only a technique of speaking [35] Gorgias is shown, despite his big claims for what he does, to be old fashioned. It makes a difference to him that he at least appear to be teaching morals. Rhetoric for Gorgias still operates within a framework which limits its power to "persuade anyone about anything" [34-35]

***Socrates on the Art of Rhetoric**

(1) Socrates defines rhetoric as a kind of cookery, a practice which has nothing to do with art, but rather requiring a kind of knack, gained by experience, producing a kind of gratification or pleasure [43]

(2) Further, it requires in its practitioners a shrewd and bold spirit together with a natural aptitude for dealing with men. The generic name I would give it is ***pandering*** { *-kolakeiav-* } [44]

This word in Greek carries an emphatic implication of moral baseness, connoting a kind of time serving opportunism which is the antithesis of forthright integrity

" < it is dishonorable because > pandering pays no regard to the welfare of its object, but catches fools with the bait of ephemeral pleasure and tricks them into holding it in highest

esteem and because it makes pleasure its aim instead of good” [46]

“ and I maintain that it is merely a knack because it has no rational account to give of the various things which it offers” [46]

—

(3) Socrates extends the image by making rhetoric a spurious counterfeit to the art of government

[44-45] This permits him to make a distinction between body and soul and say oratory is to the soul what cookery is to the body. Just as the body is incapable of distinguishing between the cook and the doctor, so the non philosophical mind fails to distinguish the orator and the sophist from the statesman whom they mimic.

*Polus’ Reply and Socrates’ Rejoinder

(1) [48] And do you think that good orators are meanly thought of in a state and regarded as panders? Note here the question now shifts. Polus is appealing to common opinion, what everybody presumably knows to show that what Socrates is saying is not the prevailing view. Socrates is “ lacking in common sense” Socrates however shows that the prevailing view is simply wrong. The common sense view concerning the successful use of speech is turned on itself

and conventional values are shown to be at variance with the very values which support them

—

(2) **The 1st Case:** Orators and Dictators are the Least Powerful Persons in the State

They Do Practically Nothing That They Wish Only What They Think Best

Socrates distinguishes behaviors in terms of *means and ends*

If a man does something for an object, he does not wish the thing that he does but the thing for which he does it

You may have the power to use a means to gain an end, or do what you may please but such power may not at all times be advantageous to you either by not giving you what you desire, or by giving you something which turns out badly.

--

(3) **The 2nd Case:** Would You Not Envy Someone Who Could Kill Confiscate or Imprison At Will?

Doing what one pleases is not the same thing as having great power is it? [Man with a knife]

[54] “Doing what one pleases can only be called a blessing or deserve the name of power if the action is attended by advantage to the actor; otherwise it is a bad and feeble thing”

Where then do you draw the line asks Socrates?” “When actions are right they bring advantage, and when they are wrong they bring the reverse.”

-

(4) **The 3rd Case:** The Example of Archlelaus

This is the case of a man who lived as he wanted, above the law, and thus offers an example of how one can be “unjust” and happy at the same time. Notice how Polus appeals to the crowd to make his point using a bit of sarcasm [57] The idea here is Polus consistently appeals to the common understanding, the conventional wisdom, if you will. and Socrates quickly reminds him

of that fact. “You produce no compelling reason why I should; you merely call a number of false witnesses against me in your attempt to deprive me of my lawful property” [58]

What is at stake: “knowledge and ignorance of who is happy and who is not”

--

(5) Socrates Position

Socrates holds to 2 positions (a) the wicked man is necessarily unhappy (b) he is more unhappy if he goes unpunished

The argument Socrates makes involves a number of propositions. Let us examine it in some detail 1st to see how Socrates proceeds and 2nd to see if the argument is ultimately persuasive. The critical point of the discussion occurs Polus when agrees to an apparently common place piece of conventional wisdom and in doing so allows Socrates to reveal its consequences.

*Socrates’ Defense of His Moral Position

(1) **Proof Number One** It is Better to Suffer Wrong Than to Do Wrong

-

*Polus admits that doing wrong is uglier, less admirable [shameful] than suffering wrong.

‘Admirable’ means either pleasant or beneficial or both

If ‘doing wrong’ is less admirable than suffering wrong we must mean that it is either less pleasant or less beneficial or both

‘Doing wrong’ is certainly not less pleasant

It must thus be less beneficial

If It Is Less Beneficial It Is Worse.

==

(2) **Proof Number Two:** It is a Greater Evil To Escape Punishment for Wrong Doing Than To Be Punished

This argument makes use of figure called “modalities of correlates” - if an agent’s act is qualified in a certain way, the patients experience must be qualified in the same way-

If A punishes B is punished

Therefore if A punishes justly, B is punished justly

What is just is -kalon- [rf 476b3 where Polus makes this admission]

What is just in this sense is beneficial i.e. [-agathon-] rf 477a2

Therefore It Is Good for B To Be Punished

====

(3) **Proof Three:** The Analogy Between Physical and Moral Health

[Dodds 1959: 254] *Commentary on 477e7 - 479 e9

Socrates works out the analogy between physical and moral health. As medicine is the art [techne] for restoring physical health so justice so justice is the art for restoring moral health. In the realm of physical health the patient whose disease is recognized and treated is more fortunate than the one who refuses treatment for his bodily errors [479 a 7] though he is less fortunate than the healthy man. So the delinquent whose moral abnormality is recognized and treated by punishment is more fortunate than the unpunished delinquent, though he is less fortunate than the honest man. Archelaus is like someone who declines to undergo a necessary operation out of cowardice and medical ignorance, not knowing what real health is like, far from

being happy [eudaimon] he is most wretched [athliotatos]

--

The remedial conception of punishment is closely bound up with the Socratic view that delinquency is in a sense involuntary and the remedial effect is held to reside not merely in the warning that future offenses also will be punished, but in recalling the delinquent to his own natural will to good and thus bringing him into tune again

--

(4) The New Definition of Rhetoric
self interested man will use rhetoric to get friends punished when it is necessary to their moral health and to save one's enemies from punishment when one wants to do them harm

Socrates and Callicles

***Shame Again**

(1) Notice as a matter of style the manner in which Callicles enters into the conversation. Unlike Polus he does not loudly interrupt but begins by asking someone else a question about Socrates position- Plato is signaling here that Callicles is at a much higher social level than the upstart Polus.

(2) [77] Callicles points out Polus was ensnared in the same manner as a Gorgias. Polus accepted as an unexamined premise the conventional notion ' doing wrong is more shameful than suffering wrong'. Socrates was able to exploit the equivocal character of the ethical terms associated with conventional thinking to reveal their lack of coherence, thus entangling Polus in a web of contradictory meanings. Callicles chides Socrates for doing this because what Socrates has done is play pretty ruthlessly upon the fact that both Gorgias and Polus have been unable to do anything more than accept the basic tents of their ethical world, for not to do so would involve them in shameful admissions and unbecoming behavior. Being unwilling to accept shame they are caught out by Socrates' questioning Callicles is well aware of what has happened, and now sets forth a much deeper point of view. He attacks the entire idea of convention itself. He does not like Polus and Gorgias accept convention as the starting point. Rather He argues that Convention is in fact the basis for the entire problem Which has now become What is the best way to live. -----

***Callicles on the -Convention Nature- Distinction**

(1) The following speech given by Callicles is one of the most famous in moral philosophy. it sets up a distinction between what is right by nature versus what is right by convention. Callicles argument and Socrates' reply are what the Gorgias has been moving toward these dialogue between Socrates and Callicles constitutes the central message of the dialogue. We shall hear to argument again when we read Republic and hear Thrasymachus make essentially the same. The Republic is in fact a response to Thrasymachus, and in more general terms to the argument presented here as well.

-

(2) By Callocles' account Polus should have never admitted that committing wrong was more

shameful than suffering it but should have distinguished between * what was shameful, i.e. dishonorable by nature [phusei] and what is so by convention [nomos]* By this last standard the worst dishonor ,i.e. shame is to suffer wrong. It is only laws and conventions which tell us the contrary, and they do so because they were created by the weak to protect themselves from the strong.

—

(3) Callicles continues by showing from examples taken from nature and international relations that man made law does not operate in these two realms. By analogy the same principle holds for the individual in relation to society. When a really strong and noble personality arises he will break out of his bondage like the lion cub, and trample on “ paper prescriptions, spells and charms” thus revealing the true, i.e natural character of justice.

--

(4) **Callicles Response To Views Expressed By Socrates:** Callicles attributes Socrates’ views to a lack of experience in practical affairs. This by Callicles account, is the result of an overmuch study of philosophy which spoils men from the serious business of life. Excellent as a training for the young, philosophy is no subject for grown men: an adult has better things to do than spend his time “whispering with the young” Callicles urges Socrates to abandon philosophy which ultimately leave him helpless to defend himself if one day he is falsely accused and brought to trial.

* Socrates on “The Noblest of All Questions:

What Use Should a Man Make of His Life?”

(1) **Socrates 1st Response** The argument rests on Callicles claiming the “Superior Class” is the same as the stronger” Socrates now shows that committing wrong is worse or more dishonorable than suffering it both according to nature as well as according to convention

The masses are stronger by nature than any individual

The law of the masses is stronger than the individual’s will

Therefore It is ‘ better’ if ‘ better’ means stronger

But the law of the masses is “equal rights for all”

Therefore Any violation of such rights is bad according to nature.

-

(2) **Socrates 2nd Response** Callicles shifts to the idea that the superior people are the physically stronger but the “ better sort of people, that is the more intelligent. Socrates takes this to mean expert and shows with some silly examples an expert in a given field of expertise is not always entitled to the larger share of what the field produces. The control of production is one thing, the distribution of the product another

(3) **Socrates 3rd Response** Another definition, the “better sort” are simply technicians but those who applied their intelligence to politics and are able to enforce their rules without spiritual softness. When Socrates asks whether these men will show self control the reply is, the proper use of courage and intelligence is not to repress the passions but to Gratify Them! Self indulgence is condemned only by those who are not able to acquire what they want. One who has power can satisfy his desires freely “ for it is this that true manliness, and true happiness consist”

[a] Socrates replies that happiness is really liberation from the tyranny of desire
Desires are endless, like leaky jars requiring a constant process of replenishment

[b] Pleasure and the Good Can Not Be the Same

Knowledge and courage are distinct from the Good seen as pleasure

We can also say Good and its opposite are not found at the same time in the same person.

It is also true pleasure and its opposite are often found in the same person at the same time

Thus pleasure is not the Good

—
(4) **Socrates' 4th Response:** We know (491bc) that the “good” man is both courageous and wise. The unworthy man is a worse man than the courageous and knowledgeable one. But the unworthy man has as much both of pleasure and pain as the courageous and knowledgeable one. Yet Callicles' argument is that the presence of pleasure and absence of pain is what makes a man “good”. On this account the worse man is both as good and as bad as the better man, and perhaps even better than he is

(5) **Callicles Shifts His Ground:** Callicles admits some pleasures better than others. Socrates can now get Callicles to move to <a> “good pleasures and pains are those productive of the good

 since all action ought to aim at the good, pleasures are sought for the sake of what is good, rather than seeking good for the sake of pleasure <c> the discrimination between good and bad pleasures is a matter of art [- techikos-]

--

The Central Idea of the Gorgias is the Following Point: This skill or art of discriminating between good and bad pleasures is something other than the knack or empirical skill of the orator.

[a] In **Republic** (580c-583 a) Plato will argue that the man best qualified to discriminate between pleasures, even on the basis of their relative pleasurable-ness, is the philosopher, since he has experienced a wider range of pleasures than anyone else and also possesses the necessary insight and reasoning power

***Who Then Are the Experts?**

(1) The artists are panders [- kolakeia-] providing performances which aim solely at giving pleasure to the audiences

-

(2) Political Oratory is of the same kind of pandering. Here Callicles objects and says some political oratory aims at the public good. Callicles gives the example of 4 statesmen: Themistocles, Cimon, Miltiades and Pericles. Men who had contributed to the rise and greatness of Athens. Socrates' ideal statesman is one who works toward producing justice and self control much along the lines of a doctor imposing order on the patient's body with a view to producing health. What these men did was gratify desires, their own and other people's. Plato's attack against these Greek leaders is shocking in the sense of being so counter intuitive. Athens was a great cultural and political center yet by Plato's account here its foundations were deeply flawed and grounded on wrong principles

—

*The Good For Man Depends Upon Self Control

(1) Plato's purpose is to show that the moral law applies to human action a principle of universal validity. He wants us to understand that the *GOOD is an Organizing Principle which makes a living creature or an artefact capable of fulfilling its function

—

(2) **The Proof:** All excellence, whether in a tool, an organism, or a mind, depends on a principle of order [-taxis- ; -kosmos-] But in the human mind this principle of order is self control [- kosmiotes sophosune -] Human excellence, and so the GOOD for man depends upon self control < 506c5 - 507 a3 >

--

(3) **The Proof: The Self Controlled Man is Happy:**

The self controlled man is also pious, just, and brave; He is entirely good

The Good Man does well; He who practices well is happy; Therefore the good man is happy By the 1st statement this means the self controlled man is happy

The idea Plato is pursuing here is “The moral life is not an addible total of virtuous conduct, as if it were the keeping of so many separate rules, - but rather a system of behavior controlled by a single ordering [- taxis-]” <507a4 -c7 >

—

(4) **Socrates Extends the Result** <507 c8 -508c3 > Socrates introduces 2 new considerations [a] the man without moral sense has no place in any community, human or divine: he will be alone and friendless, and therefore cannot be happy [b] the domain of order [kosmiotes] embraces not only human societies but the entire universe, which is therefore called cosmos. And its ruling principle is not pleonexia as Calicles supposes, but *proportion (he isotes geometrike)

[a] It is Plato's view that man's natural needs drive him into altruism. See **Republic** 578e - 579c for a description of the tyrant who has become utterly isolated from all human contact as a consequence of his overweening egoism

[b] The other idea expressed here is that the convention nature distinction is a false one . Convention is rooted in nature; the social and the natural order are expressions of the same divine law which reveals itself because it can be stated in mathematical terms [rf Republic c9]

[c] [- koinovia] community according the Pythagoreans and [- philia] govern not only the relations of one person to another, but in a much wider sense as a bond between all living things

—

(5) **Socrates on the Need For Political Science** < 509c6 - 511 a3 >

In this passage to avoid suffering and committing wrong can not depend on good intentions. Identifying with the existing regime usually leads to just those conditions that lead into doing wrong. In this passage we begin to see the problem which will occupy the pages of the Republic True power is not material power but the capacity to understand our true interest. The true art in Plato's moral theory is that which enables us to choose right from wrong

*Callicles' Response to These Results And Socrates' Reply

(1) < 511 a4 - 513 c3 > Callicles argues if you do not go along with injustice you will eventually get killed. Socrates replies that this means living well simply involves staying alive, whereas Socrates the true measure of life is not the quantity of life but its quality. The Art of living in Callicles account is the art of life saving, and by this test, the man who adapts his views to please the holders of power, i.e. please the Athenian populace pays too high a price for his security

(2) Socrates on Responsibility to the Community < 513 c4 - 515 b5 >

Callicles is not convinced Socrates' arguments are logically compelling. This is due to Callicles' emotional resistance. A statesman must improve fellow citizens wealth and power are of no help if they do not know how to use it. This requires trained practitioners [Republic: Book 7]

[a] at 513 c5 Callicles says: " It seems to me, I cannot tell how, that your statement is right, Socrates, –but I share the *common feeling*; I do not quite believe you–"

This expresses Plato's recognition that basic moral attitudes are commonly determined by psychological, not logical reasons. One of the reason we read **Gorgias** before Republic is to see that despite Socrates' arguments no one is convinced, because of this common feeling This is why Plato undertakes educational reform in the Republic.

[b] < 515 b6 - 519 b21 > In these pages Plato severely criticizes the politicians responsible Athens' greatness. . The aim of the true statesman is not to give the people what they think they want, but what is good for them. The true statesman is doing [- therapeia-] not [-diakoneia-] To mistake the politicians of Athenian history for statesmen is mistaking the pastry cook for the doctor. The result is that the disastrous results of false statesmanship do not show themselves immediately and are thus not traced to their real authors.

(3) **Callicles' Final Warning and Socrates' Reply**: Callicles reminds Socrates once again what he might expect.. Socrates says he expects it because he is one of the few true statesman in Athens. < 512a - 522e > His position in the court will be like that of doctor accused by a pastry cook before a jury of children. This matters little, so long as he has saved himself from wickedness.

[a] **This is the end of the Socrates Callicles dialogue.** What the discussion has come down to is a comparison between two ways of life. Callicles is clearly not persuaded by Socrates arguments and what Socrates does at the end in the epilogue is make a very strong "rhetorical appeal" to MYTH. It is the witness what one is willing to die for, not the argument which apparently decides the outcome of the dialogue!. We shall see the same strategy followed at the end of republic, though I must confess to being more impressed by the Myth in this dialogue than I am by the one at the end of Republic

=====

Epilogue < 523 - 527 >

(1) The Character of Myth to be understood as an imaginative expression of an insight which can not be expressed except in symbolic form

-
(2) The soul like the body retains after death the marks of a lifetime's experience. Thus the soul which has lived an evil life will show the resulting scars, and the judges will make no mistake. There is something like a law of spiritual gravitation operating through the cosmos and causes every soul to pass at death to its own place and kind. Judgment is automatic and the judges are but symbols.

--
(3) The purpose of punishment at the Last Tribunal is to provide remedial punishment and for the incurable to serve as a warning to others

-
(4) **The Conclusion** : "... the supreme object of a man's efforts, in public and in private life, must be the reality rather the appearance of goodness"

Let us then allow ourselves to *be led by the truth now revealed to us*, which teaches that the best way of life is to practice righteousness and virtue, whether living or dying; let us follow that way and urge others to follow it, instead of the way which you in mistaken confidence are urging upon me **It Is Quite Worthless Callicles**

Classical Political Theory

Section One

SETTING THE STAGE FOR PLATO'S REPUBLIC

Lecture Two

**Analyzing *Gorgias* **

Assignment

Gorgias Pp. 43 - 149

=====
Lecture Outline

Socrates and Polus

Socrates and Callicles

Epilogue

Relation to the *Republic*

Socrates and Polus

Socrates On the Art of Rhetoric

Polus: Proponent of Conventional Wisdom

Socrates Replies to Polus

Conclusion: What has the Dialectic Revealed?

Socrates and Callicles

The Distinction Between Nature and Convention

Socrates' Philosophical Principles

Socrates' Moral ViewPoint
Dialectic and Persuasion

Epilogue

The Role of Myth
The Status of the Soul
The Purpose of Punishment

Looking Ahead to the *Republic*

What has *Gorgias* Accomplished?
What Will the Problem For *Republic*?
What May We Expect Given The Outcome of *Gorgias*?

Classical Political Theory

Section One: SETTING THE STAGE FOR PLATO'S REPUBLIC

Handout Two: **Analyzing Gorgias**

Questions From The Gorgias

***Socrates and Polus**

[1] Why does Socrates call rhetoric dishonorable and merely a knack? How does the rhetoric/cookery distinction lead eventually to the distinction between body and soul?

[2] What is Polus' response to Socrates' ideas? How does Socrates' distinction between means and ends lead to the conclusion: "Orators and tyrants are the least powerful persons in the state?"

[3] Give the argument Socrates makes to establish: "It is better to suffer wrong than to do wrong"

What admission does Polus make which allows Socrates to make his case?

[4] Describe Socrates' analogy between physical and moral health. How does this analogy provide a means for evaluating the career of Archelaus?

[5] What is the definition of rhetoric reached by Socrates' discussion with Polus? Why does it seem so shocking and completely wrong?

***Socrates and Callicles**

[1] Describe the distinction made by Callicles between *Convention* and *Nature*. Provide

examples from your own experience. How does Callicles use this distinction to show where Polus went wrong? Are there any similarities between Polus' mistake and that of Gorgias?

[2] How would Callicles define justice in contrast to an everyday person? Are their contemporary examples of this type of thinking?

--

[3] In what way does Socrates demonstrate the inadequacy of the view that the superior sort of person Callicles has in mind is either the stronger or the more expert?

[4] How does Callicles' definition of superior as "successful politician" lead him to defend hedonism as the best way of life? How does Socrates show this way of life is not coherent?

--

[5] How Socrates and Callicles reach the conclusion "All action ought to aim at the Good, and [thus] pleasures are sought for the sake of what is Good, rather than seeking the Good for the sake of pleasure?"

-

[6] What is the significance of self control in relation to this conclusion?

—

[7] What are Callicles responses to these views and how do they relate to Socrates' use of myth?

QUIZ 2

[40 PTS]

1. WHAT IS MEANT BY THE IDEA THAT SOCRATES' DIALECTIC IS A FORM OF THERAPY? WHAT WOULD BE THE GOAL OF THIS THERAPY? [10]

2. WHEN RHETORIC IS DEFINED SIMPLY AS BEING ABOUT SPEAKING WHAT IS SOCRATES ABLE TO SHOW TO GORGIAS? [5]

3. WHEN RHETORIC IS DEFINED AS BEING ABOUT THE METHOD OF SPEAKING WHAT DISTINCTION DOES SOCRATES DRAW AND WHAT DOES THIS REVEAL? [5]

4. WHEN A FINAL DEFINITION IS GIVEN, RHETORIC IS ABOUT WINNING LAW CASES, AND PERSUADING THE PEOPLE WHAT MAJOR POINT EMERGES WHICH WILL LEAD THE DIALOGUE INTO NEW TERRITORY? [5]

5. WHAT IS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN BELIEF AND KNOWLEDGE HOW DOES THIS DISTINCTION LEAD TO A NEW IDEA ABOUT RHETORIC? [10]

6. GORGIAS WITHDRAWS FROM THE CONVERSATION AFTER MAKING AN IMPORTANT CONCESSION WHICH UNDERCUTS HIS EARLIER VIEW THAT HE SIMPLY TAUGHT RHETORIC. WHAT IS THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS MOMENT IN THE DIALOGUE? [5]

=====

QUIZ NO. 3
50 pts

The purpose of this quiz is to present an analysis of Gorgias
The General Question is: What is the Nature of Rhetoric and Why Is It, According to Plato in Gorgias Related to the Issue of the Good?

Include in you discussion the following

- a. the distinction between belief and knowledge
- b. the distinction between convention and nature
- c. the idea that the GOOD is an ordering principle
- d. how the results reached in Gorgias lead us to the problems of Republic

END OF PART ONE

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

***LECTURE THREE
ASSIGNMENT***

***PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS I-II
BOOKS I - II***

OVERVIEW OF REPUBLIC

1. Plato born in 427 Republic written about 375

2. Citation from Plato's Seventh Epistle

When I considered all this, the more closely I studied politicians and the laws and customs of the day, and the older I grew, the more difficult it seemed to me to govern rightly. Nothing could be done without trustworthy friends and supporters; and these were not easy to come by in an age which had abandoned its traditional moral code but found it impossibly difficult to create a new one. At the same time law and morality were deteriorating at an alarming rate, with the result that though I had been full of eagerness for a political career, the sight of all this chaos made me giddy and though I never stopped thinking how things might be improved and the constitution reformed, I postponed action, without waiting for a favorable opportunity. Finally, I came to the conclusion that all states were incapable of reform without drastic treatment and great deal of luck. I was forced, in fact, to the belief that the only hope for finding justice for the individual lay in true philosophy, and that mankind will have no respite from trouble until either real philosophy gain political power or politicians become by some miracle true philosophers

--

3. The Subject of REPUBLIC *STEPHANUS PAGES* *327 - 621*
 - a. the title
 - b. the question
 - c. the issues

4. The Link to Gorgias
 - a. the issue of shame
 - b. the role of Socratic dialectic
 - c. Callicle's prediction

5. Outline For Book I REPUBLIC
 - a. Introduction -the setting
 - b. Two views of justice
 - [i] Cephalus
- <1> telling the truth and paying back what you owe
 - [ii] Polemachus
- <1> giving everyone his due
- <2> giving everyone what is appropriate to him
- <3> benefitting one's friends and doing harm to one's enemies

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE THREE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS I-II ***BOOKS I - II [pt 2]***

-
5. Outline for Books I REPUBLIC [continued]
 - c. Thrasymachus the sophist
 - [i] justice as the interest of the stronger party
-
- d. Socrates' Approach
 - [i] the purpose of ruling
 - [ii] the unjust person not necessarily the more knowledgeable
 - [iii] injustice is not a source of strength
 - [iv] injustice does not bring happiness
 - [v] the failure of Socrates' arguments

--

- e. Glaucon's Reply
 - [i] the origins of justice in the social contract
 - [ii] appearance of justice is what is required not justice
 - [iii] justice is not valuable for its own sake
 - [iv] Adiemantus [justice is looking good not being good]
 - [v] Glaucon and Adiemantus pose the question of justice

“What we want you to show us Socrates is that justice is really a good thing and injustice a really

good thing, irrespective of rewards and punishments or reputation. The opinion of most people and that of the poets seems to support Thrasymachus' view not yours"

--

6. Outline and Reflections on Book II REPUBLIC

From Book One we see the major issue of the book "to demonstrate that morality is beneficial to its possessor that in fact an individual gains in happiness by being moral whether or not any external advantages accrue to him. Plato thus begins to work with a political analogy: perhaps it will be easier to see if we construct a community, describe its political system and look for morality in this imaginary community. Plato is describing an imaginary community to act as a model for observing what is involved in the issue of individual justice.

- a. Moving from the individual to the city
- b. The City of Pigs
- c. The City of Man
- d. The Need for Guardians
 - [i] the character of the guardians
 - [ii] the role of knowledge and the need for a philosophical temperament
 - [iii] the vital importance of education

=====

QUIZ No. 4
20 points

BOOKS ONE AND TWO REPUBLIC

=====

The purpose of this quiz is to present your understanding of the preliminary definitions of justice. Further there are two other concerns: The Conventional definition of justice as this is developed in both Gorgias in the figure of Calicles and in Republic by Thrasymachus . A second concern is the failure of dialectic and how this might be related to the analogy between the "City Soul" presented in the first part of BOOK TWO. You are thus asked to write an essay focused on the theme of the Problem presented by the conventional definitions of justice. In this essay you are asked to refer to the following ideas from the text

1. The initial definitions of justice presented by Cephalus and Polemachus
2. The definition of justice which views it as a matter of power and convention

Here strengthen your case by making a comparison to the Nature Convention distinction made in Gorgias

3. The failure of Socrates to persuade by means of dialectic argument and the transition brought about by the reformulation of the problem and Socrates' initial response via the City Soul comparison.

4. At the end of your essay Conclude by reflecting upon how the failure of dialectic at the level of individual interchange has led to a consideration of the relation of the parts of the soul and their analogue in a city

***CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY
SECTION TWO
LECTURE FOUR
ASSIGNMENT***

***PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV
BOOKS III-IV***

BOOK II (continued)

1. Character of the Guardian
 - a. importance of the division of labor
 - b. role of knowledge

and so our properly good guardian will have the following characteristics: philosophic disposition, high spirits, speed and strength

-
2. The Vital Importance of Education

guardian children must only be told stories that will have a good moral effect upon them. the idea is shape their minds and characters in such a way as to make good leaders of men

- a. types of stories
- most existing poetry is bad because it theologically misrepresents God. God is perfectly good and is therefore changeless and incapable of deceit and must never be otherwise represented**

b. character of children's minds

children cannot distinguish between what is allegory and what is not and opinions formed at that age are usually difficult to erase; we should therefore regard it as most important that the 1st stories they hear shall aim at encouraging the highest excellence of character

c. how is God to be represented

then god being good can not be responsible for everything, as is commonly said, but only for a small part of human life, for the greater part of which he has no responsibility. For we have a far smaller share of good than evil, and while god must be held to be sole cause of good we must look for some factors other than god as a cause for evil

GOD IS THE CAUSE, NOT ALL THINGS BUT ONLY OF GOOD

d. further characteristics of God

God is without deceit or falsehood in action or word, he does not change himself or deceive others; awake or dreaming, with visions or words or special signs; they shall not be represented as using magic or disguise themselves nor as playing us false in word or deed

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FOUR

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV ***BOOKS III-IV***

BOOK III

1. Analysis of Literature (continued)

a. no stories of an after life

b. no stories of ghosts

they may do well enough for other purposes; but we are afraid that the thrill of terror they cause will make guardians more nervous and less tough than they should be

--

2. Importance of Emotional Self Control

a. no public weeping by men

men should be self sufficient in what is needed for a good life and of all men least dependent on others So when any catastrophe of overtakes him, he will lament it less and bear it more calmly than others

b. impact of stories

if our young men listen passages like these seriously and don't laugh at them as unworthy, they are hardly likely to think this sort of conduct unworthy of them as men, or resist the temptation to similar words and actions. They will no shame and show no endurance but break into complaints and laments at the slightest provocation

c. other characteristics of the guardians

- <i> not too fond of laughter
- <ii> no falsehood
- <iii> self control
- <iv> no being of two minds
- <v> no undue tolerance of wickedness

-

3. The Issue of Literary Form

a. the basic idea

if it is best each have only one job and plays only one role in life dramatic or representational literature should be avoided

b representational literature

Mimesis is imitation. Plato does not wish the guardians to depart from their own character by representing other characters especially bad ones

c. 395c ff

*guardians' function was to be the expert provision of freedom for our state and *that nothing else was relevant to it was to be their sole business. They must neither do nor represent actions of any other kind, if they do take part in dramatic or their representations, they must from their earliest years act the part only of characters suitable to them*

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FOUR

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV BOOKS III-IV

BOOK III [continues]

4. No Role For Representational Literature 398 a-b

For ourselves we shall for our own good employ story tellers and poets who are severe rather than amusing, who portray the style of the good man and in their works abide by principles we laid down for them when we started out on this attempt to educate military class

--

5. Greek Music 399 b-c

Give me these two modes, one stern, one pleasant, which will best represent sound courage and moderation on good fortune or bad

--

6. Summary

a 401 b-c

we must issue orders requiring them to portray good character in their poems or not write at all; we must issue similar orders to all artists and craftsman and prevent them portraying bad character, ill discipline, meanness, or ugliness in pictures of living things, ... or any work of art, and if they are unable to comply they must be forbidden to practice their art among us

--

We shall thus prevent our guardians being brought up among representations of what is evil, and so day by day and little by little, by grazing widely as it were in an unhealthy pasture, insensibly doing themselves a cumulative psychological damage that is very serious

—

b 402 c

... we shall not be properly educated ourselves, nor will the guardians whom we are training, until we recognize the qualities of discipline, courage, generosity, greatness of mind and others akin to them, as well as their objects, all their manifestations. We must be able to perceive both the qualities themselves whenever they occur and representations of them, and must not despise instances great or small, but reckon that the same skill and training are need to recognize both

—

c. 403 e

FOR THE OBJECT OF EDUCATION IS TO TEACH US TO LOVE WHAT IS BEAUTIFUL

—

**CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY
SECTION TWO
LECTURE FOUR
ASSIGNMENT**

**PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV
BOOKS III-IV**

BOOK III [continues]

7 Educating the Body

a. features of physical education

b. signs of a society in disarray 405 a-e

And the prevalence of indiscipline and disease in a community leads, does it not to the opening of the law courts and surgeries in large numbers, and law and medicine begin to give themselves airs, especially when they are taken with great seriousness even by free men

—

And when not only the lower classes and manual workers but also those who have some pretensions to a liberal education, need skilled doctors and lawyers, that is pretty conclusive proof that education in a state is disgracefully bad. For is it not a strikingly disgraceful sign of a bad education if one has to seek justice at the hands of others as one's and judges because one lacks it in oneself?

--

And its disgraceful too to need a doctor not only for injury or regular disease, but because by leading the kind of idle life we have described we have filled our bodies with gases and

fluids and driven the medical men to invent names for our diseases

c. 410d

I have noticed that, .. , excessive emphasis on athletics produces and excessively uncivilized type while a purely literary training leaves men indecently soft.

d the impact of music 411a-b

so when a man surrenders to the sound of music and lets its sweet , soft mournful strains, which we have just described, be funneled into his soul through his ears, and gives up all his time to the glamorous moanings of song, the effect at first on his energy and initiative of mind, if he has any, is to soften it as iron is softened in a furnace, and made workable instead of hard and unworkable: but if he persists and does not break the enchantment, the next stage is that it melts and runs, till the spirit has quite run out of him and his mental sinews are cut and he has become what Homer calls a feeble fighter

e. comment on education 412a

and so we may venture to assert that anyone who can produce the perfect blend of the physical and intellectual sides of education and apply them to the training of character is producing music and harmony of far more importance than any mere musician tuning strings

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FOUR

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV BOOKS III-IV

BOOK III [continues]

8 The Personality and Its Relation to Politics -412c-d-

For we shall really need men who besides being intelligent and capable, really care for the community TRUE But we care most for what we love INEVITABLY And the deepest affection is based on identity of interest, when we feel that our own good and ill fortune is completely bound up with that of something else THAT IS SO So we must choose from among guardians those who appear to us on observation to be most likely to devote their lives to doing what they judge to be in the interest of the community and who are never prepared to act against it.

a. distinction between *Guardians* and *Auxiliaries* -414b-

strictly speaking, then, it is for them that we should reserve the term Guardian in its fullest sense, * their function being to see that friends at home shall not wish , nor foes abroad be able, to harm our state: while men whom we have been describing as guardians should more strictly be called *Auxiliaries, their function being to assist Rulers in the execution of their decisions

9 The Magnificent Myth -415b- ff

therefore the most important of god's commandants to the Rulers is that in the exercise of their function as Guardians their principle care must be to watch the mixture of metals in the characters of their children. . . AND THIS THEY MUST DO BECAUSE THERE IS

PROPHECY THAT THE STATE WILL BE RUINED WHEN IT HAS GUARDIANS OF SILVER OR BRONZE

10. The Life of a Guardian 416 d - 417 b

we must take every possible precaution to prevent our auxiliaries treating our citizens like that because of their superior strength and behaving more like savage tyrants than partners or friends

a material needs provide for

It would therefore be reasonable to say that besides being so educated they should be housed and their material needs provided for in a way that will not prevent them being excellent guardians, yet will not tempt them to prey upon the rest of the community

b. no private property

they alone therefore of all the citizens are forbidden to touch or handle silver or gold; they must not come under the same roof as them, nor wear them as ornaments, nor drink from vessels made of them. Upon this their safety and that of the state depends. If they acquire private property in land, houses or money, they will become farmers and men of business instead of guardians, and harsh tyrants instead of partners in their dealings with their fellow citizens, with whom they will live on terms of mutual hatred and suspicion; they will be more afraid of internal revolt than external attack, and be heading fast for destruction that will overwhelm themselves and the whole community

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FOUR

ASSIGNMENT

**PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV
BOOKS III-IV**

BOOK IV

1 The Purpose of the Guardian's Life

a. Adeimantus' objection -419e

But one might almost describe your Guardians as a set of hired mercenaries quartered in the city with nothing to do but perpetual guard duty

b. What the Guardians Do -421 b-

*we must therefore decide whether our object in setting up the Guardian class is to make it as happy as we can or whether happiness is a thing we should look for in the community as a whole. If it is, our Guardians and auxiliaries must be compelled to act accordingly and * be persuadedas indeed must everyone else, that it is their business to perfect themselves in their own particular job; then our state will be built on the right basis, and as it grows, we can leave each class to enjoy the share of happiness its nature permits*

--

2. Fundamental Social Principles

a no extremes of wealth

b growth commensurate with unity

c division of labor -423 d

*, , , citizens ought individually to devote their full energy to one particular job for which they are naturally suited. * In this way the integrity and unity of the individual and of the state will be preserved**

d. avoid innovations at all costs in education

e. stability in literary style - 424c

You should hesitate to change the style of your literature, because you risk everything if you do; the music and literature of a country cannot be altered without major political and social changes

f. keep number of laws to a minimum 425 e

good men need no orders, he said. They will find out easily enough what legislation is in general necessary

3. Defining Justice For the State

Justice in the state is that disposition which a state has, when all its parts function in the way they should function— that is when each of the three groups of citizens performs its own job.

-

The worst thing that might now happen and would cause the greatest harm would be if the 3 classes intermingled and interfered with each other's jobs

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FOUR

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV **BOOKS III-IV**

BOOK IV [continues]

4. The Necessary Qualities For The State

Wisdom, Courage, Self Discipline and Justice are the fundamental features of presumably perfect state which has just been created.

a. defining wisdom -428d-

knowledge exercised not on behalf of any particular interest but on behalf of the city as a whole as to benefit the state both in its internal and external relations.

-

a state is *wise* as a whole in virtue of the knowledge inherent in its smallest constituent part or class which exercises authority over the rest. and it appears further that the naturally smallest class is the one which is endowed with that form of knowledge which alone of all others deserves the title of wisdom

b defining courage -429d-

our city is brave too in virtue of a part of itself. That part retains in all circumstances the power to judge, on the basis laid down by the lawgiver in its education, what sort of things are to be feared. . . . The sort that will safely keep * the opinion inculcated by established education about what things and what kind of things are to be feared. And by retaining in all circumstances I meant retaining it safely, without losing it in pleasure or pain, desire or fear.

-
-430c- Our whole object was to steep them in the spirit of our laws like a dye, so that nature and nurture might combine to fix in them indelibly their convictions about what is dangerous, and about all other topics, and prevent them being washed out by those most powerful detergents, pleasure so much more effective than soap and soda, and pain and fear and desire the most effective of all.

c defining self discipline 431a

. . . there is a better and worse element in the personality of each individual, and that when the naturally better element controls the worst then a man is said to be master of himself. But when as a result of bad upbringing or bad company the smaller forces of one's better element are overpowered by the numerical superiority of one's worst, then one is adversely criticized and said not to be a master of oneself and to be in state of indiscipline.

--
432a: unlike courage and wisdom, which made our state brave and wise by being present in a particular part of it, *self discipline stretches across the whole scale. It produces a harmony between its strongest and weakest and middle elements, whether you measure by the standard of intelligence, or of strength or of money or the like. and so we are justified in regarding self discipline as this unanimity in which there is a natural concordance between the higher and lower about which of them is to rule in state or individual

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FOUR

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS III-IV ***BOOKS III-IV***

BOOK IV [continues]

d defining justice 433b-c

I think the quality left over, now that we have discussed discipline, courage and wisdom, must be what makes it possible for them to come into being in our state and preserves them by its continued presence when they have done so.

--
434c-d And conversely when each of our 3 classes (businessmen, auxiliaries and guardians) does its own job and minds its own business, that by contrast is justice and makes our state just

5. The Necessary Qualities For the Individual 435 b

we agreed that the state was just when its three natural constituents were each doing their job, and that it was self disciplined and brave and wise in virtue of certain other traits and dispositions of those constituents. . . Well then we shall expect to find the individual has the same three elements in his personality and to be justified in using the same language of him because he is affected by the same conditions . . . we are bound to admit that the elements and traits that belong to a state must also exist in the individuals that compose it

a the parts of the soul -436 - 440

when we see something behaving in two opposite ways at once what is happening is that a part

of it is behaving in one way and another different part is behaving in another way. This idea coupled with our experience of mental conflict between what we desire and what we know we should do establishes two parts of the soul, namely the reflective element and the element which feels hunger thirst etc. There is also anger, or indignation different from both desire and deliberation which passes judgment upon the conflict between desire and reason

-
441a The state was made up of three classes, businessmen, auxiliaries and governors; is the mind like it in having spirit as a third element which unless corrupted by bad upbringing is reason's natural auxiliary?

b the definition of justice 443d-e

the real concern of justice is not with external actions, but with a man's inward self, his true concern and interest. The just man will not allow the 3 elements which make up his inward self to trespass on each other's functions or interfere with each other, but by keeping all three in tune, like the notes of a scale will in the truest sense set his house to rights, attain self mastery and order and live on good terms with himself. When he has bound these elements into a disciplined and harmonious whole, and so become fully one instead of many, he will be ready for action of any kind, . . . and he will reckon and call any of these actions just and honorable if it contributes to and help maintain this disposition of mind and will call the knowledge which controls such actions wisdom. He will any action destructive of this disposition and the opinions which control such action ignorance

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI BOOKS V-VI

BOOK V

Socrates wishes to show now that it is always better to be just than unjust. He proposes to discuss the different ways in which there can be a lack of harmony. "We shall probably find there are as many different kinds of character as there are types and forms of constitution" [445 c]

Socrates says there five if the best is counted. However Book Five interrupts this line of thought when Glaucon and Adeimantus ask Socrates to give more details on the ideal community

1. Preserving Unity

a the status of women

454d-e there is no administrative occupation which is peculiar to woman as woman or man as man; natural capacities are similarly distributed in each sex and it is natural for women to take part in all occupations as well as men though in all women will be the weaker partners

b the status of the family

If men and women are to lead the same lives, the family must be abolished.. There are two advantages <i> it makes it possible to breed good citizens <ii> it eliminates distracting loyalties, affections and interests of the family system and diverts them to the community

The Guardians Will Become One Family

c social cohesion 462c

cohesion results from common feelings of pleasure and pain which you get when all members of a society are glad or sorry at the same successes and failures. But cohesion is dissolved when feelings differ between individuals and the same events whether of public or individual concern delight some and dismay others

d. impact of Plato's provisions

the equality between men and women, the holding of wives and children in common, the guardians being prohibited from holding property all will increase and sustain unity. Guardians will, in fact be happy, because they own nothing of their own in spite of being in control of everything

2 Examining the Details

a men and women serve together in war

b no Greek will be a slave

c no plundering corpses

3. Is This Community An Actual Possibility?

a. 472 c

then it is an ideal pattern we are looking for when we try to say what justice and injustice are in themselves, and to describe what the perfectly just and unjust man would be like if he ever existed. By turning our eyes to them and seeing what measure of happiness or its opposite they would enjoy we would be forced to admit that the nearer we approximate to them the more nearly we share their lot. That was our purpose, rather to show that the ideal could be realized in practice was it not?

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI BOOKS V-VI

BOOK V [continues]

4 The Role of the Philosopher -473d-

The society we have described can never grow into a reality or see the light of day and there will be no end to the troubles of states or indeed, my dear Glaucon, of humanity itself, *till philosophers become kings in this world, or till those we now call kings and rulers really and truly become philosophers, and political power and philosophy thus come into the same hands, while the many natures now content to follow either to the exclusion of the other are forcibly debarred from doing so*

5. What Is a Philosopher?

a. the first features

<i> 475c-d "But the man who is ready to taste every branch of learning, is glad to learn and never satisfied – he is the man who deserves to be called philosopher"

-

<ii> 476b Those who love looking and listening are delighted by beautiful sounds and colors and shapes, and the works of art which make use of them, but their minds are incapable of seeing and delighting in the essential nature of beauty itself

b the big contrast

<i> 476 c Then what about the man who recognizes the existence of beautiful things, but does not believe in beauty itself, and is incapable of following anyone who wants to lead him to a knowledge of it? Look; isn't dreaming simply the confusion between a resemblance and the reality which it resembles, whether the dreamer be asleep or awake?

-

<ii> 476d Then what about the man who, contrariwise, believes in the beauty itself and can see both it and the particular things which share it in it, and does not confuse particular things and that in which they share. Do you think he is aware or dreaming?

c. opinion versus knowledge

<i> 478 b First one correlates ignorance with what is not knowledge with what is

-

<ii> 478d Now we said before that if there was anything that appeared both to be and not be, it would be of a kind to lie between what fully is and what absolutely is not, and would be correlated neither with knowledge, nor ignorance but what appears to be between them TRUE And we now see that what we call opinion occupies that intermediate opinion

d. the difference between a philosopher and lover of opinion

<i> ***the lover of opinion sees the many examples without seeing the real thing.***

-

<ii> ***those whose hearts are fixed on the true being of each thing are philosophers not lovers of opinion***

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI ***BOOKS V-VI***

BOOK VI

1. The Characteristics of Philosophers

We shall prefer those who have the capacity to grasp the eternal and immutable, and have no less practical experience than the guardians. Philosopher shall be drawn from the guardians

The issue then becomes locating those with the natural character to be philosophers

a. trait 1

485b: one trait in the philosopher's character we can assume is his love of any branch of learning that reveals eternal reality, the realm unaffected by the vicissitudes of change

b. trait 2

Truthfulness: He will never willingly tolerate an untruth but will hate it, just as he loves truth

--

485e: So when the current of a man's desire flows toward the acquisition of knowledge and similar activities, his pleasure will be in things purely of the mind and physical pleasures will pass him by— that is if he is a genuine philosopher and not a sham

c. trait 3

and he will be self controlled and not grasping about money. other people are more likely to

worry about the things which make men so eager to grasp and spend money

—

you must see it has no touch of meanness; pettiness of mind is quite incompatible with the constant attempt to grasp things divine or human as a whole and in their entirety. And a well balanced man who is neither mean nor ungenerous nor boastful nor cowardly can hardly be difficult to deal with or unjust

--

d. Summary

Can you then possibly find fault worth an occupation for the proper pursuit of which a man must combine in his nature good memory, readiness to learn, breath of vision and grace, and be a friend of truth justice, courage and self control?

=====

2. What Philosophy is Not Valued

a. Adeimantus on the corruption of philosophy

487d . . . ***it was perfectly plain that i practice people who study philosophy too long and simply don't treat simply as part of their early education and then drop it, become, most of them, very odd birds, not to say thoroughly vicious; even while those who look the best o them are reduced by this study you praise so highly to complete uselessness as members of society***

--

b. The analogy of the ship at sea 488b - 489c

-

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI
BOOKS V-VI

BOOK VI [continues]

2. Why Philosophy Is Not Valued

c. the philosophical temperament

490b: . . . ***Our true lover of knowledge naturally strives for reality, and will not rest content with each set of particulars which opinion takes for reality, but soars with undimmed and unwearied passion till he grasps the nature of each thing as it is, with the mental faculty fitted to do so, that is with the faculty which is akin to reality, and which approaches and unites with it, and begets intelligence and truth as children, and is only released from travail when it has thus attained knowledge and true life and fulfilment***

--

d the corruption of the philosophical temperament

<i> the philosophical temperament is rare

--

<ii> only the gifted characters become particularly bad when they are badly brought up

--

<iii> the education which the Sophists give

493b in fact teach nothing but the conventional views held and expressed by the mass of the people when they meet; and this they call a science [the image of the beast: one knows the moods but does not have any idea and the nature of the beast]

--

<iv> the very features possessed by the philosophical temperament are those most readily to lead to his downfall

—

<v> the true philosopher withdraws from the world “ they see the rest of the world full of wrongdoing and are content to keep themselves unspotted from wickedness and wrong in this life and finally leave it with cheerful composure and good hope [496d]

=====

3. The Problem: Where Could True Philosophy Exist?

497b-c: *There is no existing form of society good enough for the philosophic nature with the result that it gets warped and altered like a foreign seed sown in alien soil under whose influence it commonly degenerates into the local growth.*

-

In exactly the same way the philosophic type loses its true powers and falls into habits alien to it. **If only we could find a social structure whose excellence matched its own, then its true divine quality would appear clearly and all other characters and ways of life stand revealed as merely human**

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI ***BOOKS V-VI***

BOOK VI [continues]

4. The Education of the Philosophical Temperament

a. Do not start too young

498b-c: *When they young children they should only tackle the amount of philosophic training their age can stand; while they are growing to maturity they should devote a great deal of attention to their bodies, if they are to find them a useful instrument for philosophy. When they are older and their minds begin to mature, their mental training can be intensified. Finally, when their strength begins to fail, and they are no longer fit for political and military service, they can be given their head and devote all their main energies to philosophy, that is if their life is to be happy one and their final destiny after death to match their life on earth*

—

b the philosophical temperament

500c: *his eyes are turned to contemplate fixed and immutable realities, a realm where there is no injustice done or suffered, but all is reason and order, and which is the model which he imitates and to which he assimilates himself as far as he can.*

=====

5. Starting Over

501a: The 1st thing our artists must do , . . . is to wipe the slate of human society and human habits clean. For our philosophic artists differ at once from all others in being unwilling to start work on an individual or city or draw out laws, until they are given or have made themselves a clean canvass

--

502e: The conclusion seems to be that our proposed legislation, if put into effect, would be the ideal, and that to put it into effect, though difficult would not be impossible.

a. how to find the philosopher

503e and we must test their character in the pains and fears and pleasures we have already described, and then try this character in a series of intellectual studies to see if he will have the endurance to pursue the highest forms of knowledge, without flinching as others flinch in physical trials [504d] he must work as hard at his intellectual training as at his physical; otherwise he will never finally reach the highest form of knowledge which should be peculiarly his own

6. What Must the Philosopher Know?

505a . . . *that the highest form of knowledge is knowledge of *THE FORM OF THE GOOD*, from which things that are just, and so on derive their usefulness and value*

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI BOOKS V-VI

BOOK VI [continues]

6. What Must the Philosopher Know?

505e: *the Good then is the end of all endeavor, the object on which every heart is set, whose existence it divines , though it finds it difficult to grasp just what it is; and because it can not handle it with the same assurance as other things it misses any value those other things have Can we possibly agree that the best of our citizens to whom we are going to entrust everything should be in the dark about so important a subject? [506b] at any rate a man will not be a very useful guardian of what is right and valuable if he does not know in what their goodness consists; and I suspect that until he does so no one can know them adequately*

7. The Simile of the Sun

508e Then what gives the objects of knowledge their truth and the knower's mind the power of knowing is the FORM OF THE GOOD. It is the cause of knowledge and truth, and you will be right to think of it as being itself known, and yet as being something other than, and even more splendid than knowledge and truth as splendid as they are. And just as it was right to think of

light and sight as being like the sun, but wrong to think of them as being the sun itself, so here again it is right to think of knowledge and truth as being like the Good, but wrong to think of either as being the Good, whose position must be ranked higher.

--

509b-c The GOOD therefore may be said to be the source not only of intelligibility of the objects of knowledge, but also of their being and reality; yet it is not itself that reality but is beyond it, and superior to it in dignity and power

THE GOOD IS THE SOURCE OF REALITY AND TRUTH WHICH GIVES INTELLIGIBILITY TO OBJECTS OF THOUGHT AND THE POWER OF KNOWING TO THE MIND

8. The Analogy of the Divided Line

[From Lee's translation pp. 309-311]

*The purpose of the LINE is illustrate the relation between the two orders of reality described by the simile of the SUN from the standpoint of *the States of Mind* in which we apprehend these two orders or realms*

—

The two realms are: **The VISIBLE** and **INTELLIGIBLE** and corresponding to each of these are what Plato calls **KNOWLEDGE AND OPINION**. There are two further divisions for Knowledge and for Opinion and these correspond to the mental states which make up the LINE

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE FIVE

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS V-VI BOOKS V-VI

BOOK VI [continues]

7. The Analogy of the Divided Line

The Mental States are described by Plato as:

a. **INTELLIGENCE** Full understanding culminating in the vision of ultimate truth This is reached by *Philosophy*

—

b. **REASON** The procedure of mathematics, purely deductive and uncritical of its assumptions

--

c. **BELIEF** Common sense beliefs on matters moral and physical, which are a fair practical guide to life, but have not been fully thought out

—

d. **ILLUSION** All the various illusions, secondhand impressions and opinions of which the minds of ordinary people are full

510c - 511c: Plato use the practice of the geometers to illustrate the different sections of the LINE. They start by making certain assumptions which permit them to begin to reason and draw conclusions concerning their subject. They use visible figures to model their thinking with the clear understanding that they are not the reality which is being reasoned about.

“ They treat these as images only, the rel objects of their investigation being invisible except to the eye of reason”

511b-c the last section of the line is the very process of argument grasped by the dialectic; it treats assumptions not as principles but as assumptions in the truest sense, that as starting points and steps in the ascent to something which involves no assumptions and is the first principle of everything; when it has grasped the principle it can again descend, by keeping to the consequences that follow from it to a conclusion. **The whole procedure involves nothing in the sensible world, but moves solely through forms to forms and finishes with forms**.

Summary

513e: So please take it that there are corresponding to the four sections of the line, THESE FOUR STATES OF MIND: to the top section **Intelligence**; to the second **Reason**; to the third **Belief**, and to the last **Illusion**, and you may arrange them in a scale, and assume that they have degrees of clarity corresponding to the degree of truth possessed by their subject matter

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY
SECTION TWO
LECTURE SIX
ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII
BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOK VII

Allegory of the Cave

Desmond Lee 316: we are shown the ascent of the mind from illusion to pure philosophy, and the difficulties which accompany its progress. And the philosopher when he has achieved his supreme vision is required to return to the cave to serve his fellows, his very unwillingness to do so being his chief qualification

1. The Setting

514a: I want you to go on to picture the enlightenment or ignorance of our human condition somewhat as follows. Imagine an underground chamber like a cave, with a long entrance open to the daylight and as wide as the cave. In this chamber are men who have been prisoners there since childbirth, their legs and necks being fastened that they can only look straight ahead of them and they cannot turn their heads

a. 515a: could our prisoners see anything of themselves or their fellows except the shadows thrown by the fire on the wall of the cave opposite of them?

b. 516d There was probably a certain amount of honor and glory to be won

among prisoners and prizes for keen sightedness for those best able to remember the order of sequence among the passing shadows and so best be able to divine their future appearances

=====

2. The Ascent

515b: Suppose one of them were let loose and suddenly compelled to stand up and turn his head and look and walk toward the fire; all these actions would be painful

a. he is temporarily blinded and the process would be a gradual one 515e

--

b. the final vision 517e

*the final thing to be perceived in the intelligible region and perceived only with difficulty is the **FORM OF THE GOOD**; once seen, it is inferred to be responsible for whatever is right and valuable in anything, producing in the visible region light and the source of light, and being, in the intelligible region itself controlling source of truth and intelligence*

--

c. reactions

<i> cave dwellers will be hostile

<ii> returning leaves the philosopher disoriented

<iii> the philosopher must be compelled to return to the cave

519d: then our job as lawgivers is to compel the best minds to attain what we call the highest form of knowledge and to ascend to the vision of the good as we have described, and when they have achieved this and see well enough prevent them behaving as they are now allowed to do

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

**PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII
BOOKS VII-VIII**

BOOK VII

Allegory of the Cave

3. -Summary-

--

Desmond 320: -Tied prisoner in the Cave = **Illusion**;

-Freed prisoner in the Cave- = **Belief**;

-Looking at shadows an the world outside the cave and the ascent thereto = **Reason**

- Looking at real things in the world outside the cave = **Intelligence**

-Looking at the Sun = **Vision of the form of the Good**

=====

The Education of the Philosopher

518c-d: we must reject the conception of education professed by those who say that they can put into the mind knowledge that was not there before – rather as if they could sight into blind eyes

But our argument indicates that the capacity for knowledge is innate in each man's mind, and

that organ by which he learns is like an eye which can not be turned from darkness to light unless the whole body is turned; in the same way the mind as a whole must be turned away from the world of change until its eye can bear to look straight at reality and at the highest of all realities which is what we call the good

--

521c: What is at issue is: the conversion of the mind from a kind of twilight to the true day, that climb up into reality which we shall call true philosophy. **What then should men study if their minds are to be drawn from the world of change into reality?**

--

1. Contrast to the Previous Education

522a: { the previous education } gave a training by habituation, and used music and rhythm to produce a certain harmony and balance of character and not knowledge; and its literature whether fictional or factual had similar effects. There was nothing in it to produce the effect you are seeking

2. Subjects Which Philosopher Must Learn

a. Mathematics

523a: is probably one of the subjects we are looking for which naturally leads to thought, though no one makes proper use of its great power to draw men to reality. This is because “ we are called upon to use our reason when our senses receive opposite impressions, but when they do not there is nothing to awaken thought” [524 d]

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOK VII

2. Subjects Which the Philosopher Must Learn [continued]

b. the five mathematical studies

<i> *arithmetic* –the consideration of *unity* –

524e: If our perception of the unity, by sight or any other sense is quite unambiguous, then it does not draw the mind towards reality any more than did the perception of its opposite, and seems to involve plurality as much as unity, then it calls for an exercise of judgment and forces the mind into a quandary in which it must stir itself to think and **ask what unity in itself is**; and if that is so **the study of the unit is among those that lead the mind on and turn to the vision of reality.**

<ii> *plane geometry* this is studied as a way of training the mind to grasp the form of the Good

--

<iii> *solid geometry* is an undeveloped science which should be studied for the purpose of

learning more astronomy

—

<iv> *astronomy* this subject is studied with the idea that the motions are realities reflecting the mathematical forms “ We shall therefore treat astronomy ., like geometry as setting us problems for solutions and ignore the visible heavens, if we want to make a genuine study of the subject and use it to convert the mind’s natural intelligence to a useful purpose.

--

<v> *harmonics* Here Plato wants to follow the Pythagoreans who look for numerical relationships in audible concords

c the dialectic

<i> *What is the Dialectic?* [532a] So when one tries to get at what each thing is in itself by the exercise of dialectic, **relying on reason without any aid from the senses, and refuses to give up until one has grasped by pure thought what the good is in itself**, one is at the summit of the intellectual realm, as the man who looked at the sun was of the visual realm

<ii> *What is Its Relation to the Sciences?* [532d] Well, the whole study of the sciences we have described –has the effect of leading the best element in the mind up toward the vision of the best among realities, just as the body’s clearest organ was led to the sight of the brightest of all things in the material and visible world

<iii> *Preliminary Description* [[533d] Dialectic is the only procedure which proceeds by the **destruction of assumptions to the very first 1st principles so as to give itself a firm base.** [534b] a dialectician **takes into account the essential nature of each thing.** Dialectic is the **coping stone that completes the course of studies and there is no other study rightly place above it**

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO’S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOK VII

BOOK VII

3. The Curriculum

a. **The character of the philosopher**

[539d] ensure that only men of steady and discipline character shall be admitted to philosophic discussions, and not anyone, however unqualified, as happens at present.

<i> intellectual eagerness and must learn easily , have a good memory, determination and fondness for hard work

--

<ii> one is handicapped in the pursuit of the truth, which while it detests deliberate lying and will not abide it in itself, and is indignant to find it in others, cheerfully acquiesces in conventional ,misrepresentations and feels no indignation when its own ignorance is shown up, but wallows in it like a pig in a sty

—

<iii> 537c: at the age of 20 some of them will be selected for promotion and will have to bring

together the disconnected subjects they studied in childhood **and take a comprehensive view of their relationship with each other and the nature of reality.** This is the best test for dialectic **which is the ability to take the comprehensive view**

b The Dialectic Can Do Harm

[538e] When he has lost any respect or feeling for his former beliefs but not yet found the truth, where is he likely to turn? **Won't it be to a life which flatters his desires?** Thus It should not be taught to the Young

c. The End of the Process

540a-b: And when they are 50 those who have come through all our practical and intellectual tests with distinction must be brought to their final trial and made to lift their Mind's Eye to look at the source of all light and see the Good itself which they can take as a pattern for ordering their own life as well as that of society and the individual. For the rest of their lives they will spend the bulk of their time in philosophy, but when their turn comes they will in rotation, turn to the weary business of politics, and for the sake of society, do their duty as rulers, not for honor they get by it but as a matter of necessity. And so, when they have brought up their successors like themselves to take their place as guardians, they will depart to the islands of the blest, and the state will set up a public memorial to them and sacrifice to

And some of them will be women, I reminded him All I have said about men applies equally to women, if they have the requisite natural capacities

540d: **The indispensable condition is that political power should be in the hands of one or more true philosophers.** They would despise all present honors as mean and worthless, and care most for doing right and any rewards it might bring; and they would regard justice as being of paramount importance and throughout their reorganization of society serve and forward it.

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

**PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII
BOOKS VII-VIII**

BOOK VIII

1. Summary

The proposals put forward are now summarized 543-544 as well at the beginning of Plato's dialogues **Timeaus** [at the beginning] and his dialogue **Critias**

2 The Types of Societies and Corresponding Personality Types

544c-545c: Plato identifies 5 types of societies:

The Ideal; Timocracy; Oligarchy; Democracy and Tyranny

--

Associated with each of these types is a characteristic personality; a type which is the person most looked up to as the ideal in the given society: As Plato puts it [544e]

Societies are not made of sticks and stones, but of men whose individual characters by turning

the scale one way or the other determine the direction of the whole

545b: We shall look at each type of society starting with the timocratic and look at the corresponding individual beside it. Thus we can contrast the worst type of man with the best and complete our inquiry into the relative happiness and unhappiness which pure justice and injustice bring to their possessor

—

3. The Timocracy

545d Change in any society starts with civil strife among the ruling class; as long as the ruling class remains united, even if it is quite small, no change is possible

--

a. How the Ideal Society Changes

546a-b: it will be difficult to bring about any change for the worse in a state so constituted, ****But since all created things must decay, even a social order of this kind can not last for all time, but will decline. . . Rulers you have trained for your city are wise, reason and observation will not always enable them to hit on the right and wrong times for breeding; sometime they will miss them and the children will be begotten amiss****

LEE (361): no mortal institution can last forever, and that the process of decline from the ideal is started by a generations of guardians wrongly bred because of failure to observe the appropriate procedure, a failure whose occurrence is in some way controlled by an elaborate mathematical formula

— b. The Character of Timocracy

the result of the change is an inability to distinguish among the different metals There is a compromise between the two elements and form lies between the ideal and oligarchy. The emphasis will be more on the honor part of the personality[ambition and competitive spirit with a secret love for money

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII ***BOOKS VII-VIII***

BOOK VIII

4. The Timocratic Man

548e-549; He must be rather more self willed and rather less well educated, though not without an interest in the arts, ready to listen, but quite incapable of expressing himself. . . his nature has a touch of avarice and there are flaws in his character because he has lost his best safeguard a blend of reason and a properly trained imagination

--

549d-550c: A dynamic is set up for the next generation when the son is torn between his father's influence fostering the growth of his rational nature and that of the others which foster his desire and ambition "And since he is not really at heart a bad chap, but has merely got into bad company, he takes the middle course between the two and resigns control of himself to the middle element and its competitive spirit and so becomes an arrogant and ambitious man

5. Oligarchy

550d: An oligarchy is a society where it is wealth that counts and where political power is in the hands of the rich and the poor have no share of it. The accumulation of wealth in private hands is what destroys timocracy. The men find ways to become extravagant and for this reason pervert the law and disobey it, and the women follow their example. [551 “so the higher the prestige of wealth and the wealthy the lower that of goodness and good men will be”

--

Wealth is introduced as a requirement for office and the poor are despised. Wealth is poor prerequisite for political office. It is also true that a major fault of oligarchy is that it splits society into two factions the rich and the poor. This makes it difficult to wage war because the lower class can not be armed, and this type of society generates drones, i.e. paupers who have nothing to contribute because of their lack of money. There are now also criminals where there were none before. *There is no moral conviction, no training of desire, but only the compulsion of fear* There is some respectability but no real goodness The Grasping Money Maker corresponds to the Oligarchic society

6. Democracy

Democracy originates from the oligarchy because the rich show no restraint in getting as rich as they can. There is thus a tendency toward extravagance and a gradual redistribution of wealth takes place reducing people to poverty who in turn develop an animus against the rich.. The children of the rich become indolent in both the physical and intellectual sense. Further, a kind of class consciousness eventually emerges . In some cases this leads to factional fighting, and when the poor win, kill or exile their opponents and give the rest equal civil rights and opportunities of office, appointment to office being as a rule by lot

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOK VIII

6. Democracy [continued]

a. the features of a democracy

557b-c: The people will be . There is liberty and freedom of speech in plenty, and every individual is free to do as he likes. . . . Granted that freedom everyone arranges his life as pleases him best

—

557e: Then in a democracy there is no compulsion either to exercise authority if you are capable of it, or to submit to authority if you don't want to; you need not fight if there is a war, or you can wage a private war in peacetime if you don't like peace; and if there is any law that debars you from political or judicial office, you will none the less take either if they come your way.

****It is a wonderfully pleasant way of carrying on in the short run isn't it? ****

—

558c: **These then and similar characteristics are those of democracy. It is an agreeable anarchic form of society, with plenty of variety, which treats all as equal, whether they are equal or not**

7. Democratic Personality Type

Plato first described the Oligarchic type once again as one who in the interest of pursuing money restrains his desires and spends only on necessary desires. This person is then compared to the “Drone” [559d] “Then what we called the drone type will as said be swayed by a mass of such unnecessary pleasures and desires and the thrifty oligarch type by necessary ones”

--

The democratic man emerges when the offspring of the oligarchic man falls into the company of the drones. Just as in the oligarchic society there is a conflict between the rich and poor, inside the democratic man there is a conflict between the restrained oligarchic personality and the democratic one where unlimited desire reigns

The Result [560b] In the end they capture the seat of government, having discovered that the young man’s mind is devoid of sound knowledge and practices and true principles, the most effective safeguards the mind of man can be blessed with. . . . the vacant citadel in the young man’s mind is filled instead by an invasion of pretentious fallacies and opinions

Further [560d-e] they call shame silliness and drive it into exile; they call self control cowardice and expel it with abuse; and they call on a lot of useless desires to help them banish economy and moderation, which they maintain are mere provincial parsimony

Further [561c] If anyone tells him that some pleasures because they spring from good desires are to be encouraged and approved, and others springing from evil desires are to be disciplined and repressed he won’t listen or his mind to the truth, but shakes his head and says all pleasures are equal and should have equal rights

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO’S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOKS VII-VIII

BOOK VIII

7. Democratic Personality Type [continued]

Further [561d-e] *There is no order or restraint in his life and he reckons his way of life is pleasant, free and happy, and sticks through it through thick and thin. . . . and I think that the versatility of the individual and the attractiveness of his combination of a wide variety of characteristics, match the variety of the democratic society. It is a life which many men and women would envy, it contains patterns of so many constitutions and ways of life*

8. Tyranny

Plato [562c] argues that excessive for desire for liberty undermines democracy and leads ultimately to tyranny Psychologically, [562d] “ It goes on to abuse as servile and contemptible those who obey authorities and reserves its approval , in private life, as well as in public for

rulers who behave like subjects and subjects who behave like rulers In such a society the principle of liberty is bound to go to extremes

562e: there is family breakdown and a reversal of roles

563a: educational authority diminishes

563b: equality of slaves and gender equality

563c: equality of domestic animals

The General Disposition of the Population [563d] What it adds up to is this : You find that the minds of the citizens become so sensitive that the least vestige of restraint is resented as intolerable, till finally, in their determination to have no master, they disregard all laws written or unwritten

Conclusion [564a] So from an extreme of liberty one is likely to get, in the individual and in society, a reaction to an extreme of subjection. And if that is so , we should expect tyranny to result from democracy, the most savage subjection from an excess of liberty

--

a. The Transformation of a Democracy into a Tyranny

Plato sets up three groups: <i> the drones described earlier; in a democracy almost all the leaders are drawn from this class <ii> the more energetic among the population who become rich, and <iii> the inert mass who take little interest in politics and are not very well off

A dynamic is set up where the political class ,i.e. the drones take from the new rich keep as much as they can and redistribute the rest to the lesser off population. Conflict is set into motion between the people and the rich with the rich turning to the older oligarchs and the poor resorting to a popular leader whom they “nurse” to greatness. **For it is the “popular leader” who leads the class war against the owners of property Tyranny arises from this root cause**

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SIX

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VII-VIII ***BOOKS VII-VIII***

BOOK VIII [continues]

a. The Transformation of Democracy into Tyranny [continued]

The Popular Leader asks and receives a Bodyguard, which makes him more autonomous His behavior, by Plato’s account has the following features

566e: generally perceived as benign; assists the poor; expands public works

567a-d: after foreign wars, will continue to stir up war and impose high level of war taxation; will have internal purges to stifle dissent; will increase his bodyguard

interestingly enough, Plato always sees the tyrant courting the tragic poets who act to sustain their regime through their art [568c] “ Yes, and I expect they will make a tour of other states where they will hire actors, with their fine persuasive voices to play their works to large audiences, and sway them over to tyranny or democracy

Summary [569b-c] “ Then He said with emphasis , people will find out soon enough what sort of beast they have bred and groomed for greatness. He will be too strong for them to turn out. . . In fact, here we have real tyranny, open and avowed and people find, as the saying goes that they have jumped out of the frying pan of subjection to free men into the fire of submission to slaves, and exchanged their excessive and untimely freedom for the harshest and bitterest of servitudes, where the slave is master”

BOOK IX

The Tyrannical Character

Plato begins by discussing dreams, what happens to us when we sleep and allow the more rational part of ourselves ‘drop its guard’. The personality dynamic of the tyrant originates from being the offspring of the democratic man. In the democratic man the excesses of liberty are balanced by the part which is retained from being brought up in the oligarchic household. There is, in other words, still some sense of restraint though it is not restraint for anything more than making money

When this man has offspring the moderate side is more easily corrupted and the emergence of the tyrannic personality is associated with the appearance of undisciplined desire.

573 b: Then the master passion runs wild and takes madness into its service; any opinions or desires with a decent reputation and any feelings of shame still left are killed or thrown out, until all discipline is swept away, and madness usurps its place

--

573c: Then a precise definition of a tyrannical man is one who either by birth or habit or both, combines the characteristics of drunkenness, lust and madness

--

Plato describes after this definition how such a personality leads step by step to fraud and deceit, robbery and violence, and crimes even against his parents.

—

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX BOOKS IX - X

BOOK IX [continues]

The Tyrannical Character [continued]

The Outcome: The step after the descent into immorality is politics. Such crimes are relatively minor they do not become tyrannical until they take on a broader social meaning

575c: Minor is a relative term and so far as the welfare or wickedness of the community goes, crimes like these don't come anywhere near tyranny. ****But when criminals and their followers increase in numbers and become aware of their strength, the “FOLLY OF THE PEOPLE” helps them to produce a tyrant, and they pick a man who is at heart the completest and most absolute tyrant****

575e- 576a: Men of this kind behave in the same sort of way on private life, before they have

gained power. Their companions are parasites in every way subservient to them and they are always prepared to give way and put on the most extravagant act of friendship if it suits their purpose, though once that purpose is achieved their tune changes

So tyrannical characters pass their lives without a friend in the world; they are always either master or slave and never taste true friendship or freedom

-
576c: Now isn't it clear that the most wicked man will also prove to be the unhappiest. And therefore in fact the longer and more extensive a tyrant's power the greater and more lasting his unhappiness is, whatever most people may think?

The Analysis of Happiness

Plato now turns to a comparative analysis of both personality and regimes. his goal is finally to reach an understanding of the question put to Socrates at the beginning of Book II as to the very best way of life

--

578d-e: The Tyrannical Mind Set → His mind will be burdened with servile restrictions, because the best elements in him will be enslaved and completely controlled by a minority of the lowest and most lunatic impulses. . . . So the mind in which there is a tyranny will also be least able to do what, as a whole, it wishes because it is under the compulsive drive of madness, and so full of confusion and remorse

At 579e: So, whatever people may think, the truth is that the real tyrant is really a slave of the most abject kind of dependent on scoundrels. He can never satisfy his desires and behind his many wants you can see, if you know how to survey it as a whole, the real impoverishment of his character; his life is haunted by fear and if the condition of the states he rules is any guide, as we know it is –torn by suffering and misery

—

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX BOOKS IX - X

BOOK IX [continues]

The Tyrannical Character [continued]

At 580a: Plato describes the life of the tyrant as the most wretched of all He is not able to rely on anyone and is surrounded by enemies on every side [580] “ his power will make him still more envious, untrustworthy, unjust, friendless, and godless and home for every iniquity, and you can see that he is a source of misery above all to himself but also to his neighbors.”

The Happiness of the Philosopher

580c: the supremely happy man is the one who is the most just and the best that is, *the philosopher king who is sovereign over himself*, and the supremely wretched man is the one who is most unjust and worst, that is again, the man who is most tyrannical and tyrannizes

completely both over himself and over his own country

Plato Reviews the Previous Points [580e-581e]

<i> The mind of the individual is divided into 3 elements one giving understanding; another spirit and enterprise; the final one desire.

-

<ii> men are divided into three basic types according to whether their motive is knowledge, success or gain. And each of these types corresponds to the three classes in the state

-

<iii> each type has associated with it an appropriate pleasure, which they associate with the highest good

Here is the Issue [582a]

When therefore there is dispute about the 3 types of pleasure and the 3 types of life, and they are being compared simply on the grounds of the amount of pleasure they give and without any reference to how admirable or how good or bad they are, how are we to know what is the truth?

--

The Key Comparison and the Conclusion Drawn from It [582b - 583]

Which of the 3 men we have described has the greatest experience of all three types of pleasure?

***Is the gain lover's knowledge of the truth such that you would rank his experience of the pleasures of knowledge above the philosopher's experience of the pleasures of gain?**

--

Further: Now, if wealth and profit were the best criterion, the preferences and dislikes of the gain lover would inevitably contain the highest degree of truth. And if our criterion were honor, success and courage, the same would be true of the man of honor and ambition

--

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX

BOOKS IX - X

BOOK IX [continues]

The Happiness of the Philosopher [continued]

The Conclusion [582 e - 583a]

... we are judging by experience, intelligence and reason, it follows that truth is to be found in the preferences of the philosopher and the man of reason. Therefore of the 3 types of pleasure, the most pleasant is that which belongs to the element in us which brings us knowledge and the man in whom that element is in control will live the most pleasant life

Another Proof The Philosopher is Better Off Than the Tyrant [583c ff]

--

1st Idea: Pleasure is the cessation of pain and Pain the cessation of pleasure. however, this is not the case universally *Pure pain or Pure pleasure is not necessarily a comparative relation. It is the case however that the Most intense pleasures which we do experience come through the body and are for the most matters of degree defined or experienced with respect to something else.

585a *Then is it surprising that the views of men who lack experience of the truth should be as unsound about pleasure as they are about a good many other things? When they are subjected to pain, they will think they are in pain and their pain will be real. But they will be convinced that the transition from pain to the neutral state brings satisfaction and pleasure, whereas in fact their lack of experience of true pleasure leads them to make a false contrast between pain and the absence of pain **Just as someone who has never seen white might suddenly contrast grey with black***

Way Of life Described [586] Those therefore who have no experience of wisdom and goodness, and do nothing but have a good time, spend their life straying between the bottom and middle in our illustration, and never rise higher to see or reach the true top, nor achieve any real fulfillment or sure and unadulterated pleasure. They bend over their tables, like sheep with heads bent over their pasture and eyes on the ground, they stuff themselves and cpluate, and in their greed for more they kick and butt each other with hooves and horns of steel, and kill each other because they are not satisfied, as they cannot be while filled with unrealities a part of themselves wich is itself unreal and insatiable.

The Ideal Described [586e - 587a] Then if the mind will follow the lead of its philosophic element, without internal division, each element will be just and in all other respects perform its own function, and in addition will enjoy its own particular pleasures which are the best and truest available to it. But when either of the two other elements is in control, it cannot achieve its own proper pleasure, and compels the other two to pursue a false pleasure that is not their own

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX BOOKS IX-X

BOOK IX [continues]

CONCLUSION

587c- 588a The philosopher king lives 729 times more pleasantly than the tyrant and the tyrant the same amount more painfully than the philosopher king which shows how much difference there is between the just and unjust man in terms of pleasure and pain! And if the good and just man is so much superior to the bad and unjust man in terms of pleasure, will not this superiority be infinitely greater in terms of grace and beauty of life and of excellence?

588c: Plato asks us to imagine a many headed beast which is very large . Add to this a lion

which is the next largest and a man Put these together and combine them to form a single creature, and let the outer appearance be that of a man the other two being invisible.

--

Now by Plato's account [589] to do wrong and not to do right is the same thing as feeding the two beasts at the expense of the man

HERE IS THE MAIN POINT [589c-d]

The glorification of injustice is therefore wrong on all counts and the glorification of justice is right. For, whether you look to pleasure or profit or reputation, to praise justice is to tell the truth, to disparage to talk in ignorance of what you are disparaging and entirely unsound

—

Plato admonishes us not to allow our higher nature be driven by the lower. What is true for the individual psyche is also true for the organization of society. At the individual level nothing can be more desirable than the qualities which conduce to self control thus permitting one to attune his body to match the harmony of his mind and character.

--

FINAL STATEMENT [592a-b]

He will follow the same principles over honors, private or public. If he thinks they will make him a better man he will accept and enjoy them, if he thinks they will destroy the order within him, he will avoid them – If that is his object he won't enter politics he said—;

–O yes he will I replied very much so in the society where he really belongs; but not I think in the society where he is born, unless some miracle happens– ; –I see what you mean, he said *You mean that he will do so in the society which we have been describing and which we have theoretically founded; but I doubt if it will ever exist on earth*

Perhaps I said *it is laid up as a pattern in heaven where he who wishes can see it and found it in his own heart. But it does not matter whether its exists or ever will exist; in it alone and in no other society could he take part in public affairs* I expect you are right

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX BOOKS IX-X

BOOK X

1. INTRODUCTION

Plato presents three ideas in Book Ten

- a. a critique of the dramatic art which is linked to the divided line
- b. an argument for the immortality of the soul
- c. the myth of Er in which Plato describes for us the character of life after death

2. A Critique of the Dramatic Artists

598b: The art of representation is therefore a long way removed from truth, and it is able to

reproduce everything because it has little grasp of anything, and that little is of mere phenomenal appearance

--

602 a: There are three ways of doing something : you can use it; you can make it; you can represent it

--

The maker of an implement, therefore has correct belief about its merits and defects, but he is obliged to get this by associating with and listening to someone who knows And the person with the relevant knowledge is the user. What about the artist and his representation? Has he the user's direct experience of things he paints to enable him to know whether his pictures are good or right. Or has he the correct opinion that springs from enforced acquaintance with and obedience to someone who knows what he ought to paint. *He has neither!*

*****So the artist has neither knowledge nor correct opinion about the goodness or badness of the things he represents. The artist thus knows little or nothing about the subject he represents and the art of representation is something that has no serious value; and this applies above all to tragic, poetry epic or dramatic.*****

3. How Does Art Impact the Human Mind?

602c - 604 Plato tells us that measurement, counting and weighing are used to discern what is illusory from what is real. Art, on the other hand, owes its power to its ability to exploit illusion for our pleasure and enjoyment..

--

This true not only for representational art but also for poetry and drama. Plato tells us that such types of art require conflict in order to be interesting. Further it is hard to represent the reasonable element inside us. Because of these facts, dramatic representation works against Plato's idea that unity under the guidance of the deliberative element is the supreme value 604c: "we must learn not to hold our hurts and waste our time crying, like children who have bumped themselves, * but to train our mind to cure our ills and rectify our lapses as soon as it can, banishing sorrow by healing it*"

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX BOOKS IX-X

BOOK X

4. Art Corrupts the Best Characters

606a: If you consider that the poet gratifies and indulges the instinctive desires of a part of us, which we forcibly restrain in our private misfortunes, with its hunger for tears and for an uninhibited indulgence in grief. Our better nature, being without intellectual or moral training relaxes its control over those feelings, on the grounds that it is someone else's sufferings it is watching and that there is nothing to be ashamed of in praising and pitying another man with some claim to goodness who shows excessive grief; besides it reckons the pleasure it gets as sheer gain, and would certainly not consent to be deprived of it by condemning the whole poem

--

For very few people are capable of realizing that *What we Feel for other people must infect what we feel for ourselves, and that if we let our pity for the misfortunes of others grow too strong it will be difficult to restrain our feelings as our own

--The Only Art Permitted--

607a: But you will know that the only poetry that should be allowed in a state is hymns to the gods and paeans in praise of good men; **Once you go beyond that and admit the sweet lyric or epic muse, pleasure and pain become your rulers instead of law and the rational principles commonly accepted as best**

--

5. Conclusion

608b-c Our theme shall be that such poetry has no serious value or claims to truth, and we shall warn its hearers to fear its effects on the constitution of their inner selves and tell them to adopt the view of poetry we have described

--

FURTHER: *Yes, my dear Glaucon I said, because the issues at stake *the choice between becoming a good man or bad man are even greater than they appear and neither honor nor wealth nor power nor poetry itself should tempt us to neglect the claims of justice and excellence of every kind*

=====

6. The Immortality of the Soul and the Rewards of Goodness

The idea is that the soul in its essential nature is not diverse and variable and full of internal conflicts. It is the soul's love of wisdom which puts it into contact with the divine and immortal and the eternal. Now if it is true that destruction results from some specific flaw which attacks what is essential for that thing, it follows that given the essential nature of the soul, i.e. its love of wisdom that there is really nothing which can attack this and thus the soul is immortal

--

The Rewards of Goodness 613c: If the truth be told, isn't it this – that the clever rogue is rather like a runner who does well over the first half of the course, but then flags

CLASSICAL POLITICAL THEORY

SECTION TWO

LECTURE SEVEN

ASSIGNMENT

PLATO'S REPUBLIC: BOOKS VIII-IX

BOOKS IX-X

BOOK X

The Myth of Er

The Character of Justice [614] These then said I are the prizes and rewards and gifts which the just man receives from the gods and men while he is still alive, over and above those which justice herself brings him. Yet they are nothing in number and magnitude compared to the things that await the just man and unjust man after death; so you must hear about these too so that our discussion may pay in full what it owes to both of them

--

The Story

- a. Er returns from the dead
- b. The initial judgment
- c. The meeting of the souls coming down and those from earth
- d. The judgement for wickedness and goodness
- e. The eight day and the band of light
- f. The cosmological wheel and music of the spheres
- g. Choosing the next life “ Souls of a day you must another life whose end is death. no guardian spirit will be allotted to you; you shall choose your own. And he on whom the lot falls first shall be the first to choose the life which then shall of necessity be his. *Excellence knows no master; a man shall more or less of her according to the value he sets on her. The fault lies not with God but with the soul that makes the choice*

There was no choice of quality of character since of necessity each soul must assume a character appropriate to its choice. And because this is so The Knowledge and Ability to tell a good life from a bad one and always choose the better so far as we can is absolutely vital

=====

END OF REPUBLIC

And so my dear Glaucon, his tale was preserved from perishing, and if we remember it, may well preserve us in turn, and we shall cross the river of Lethe safely and shall not defile our souls. This at any rate is my advice, that we should believe the soul to be immortal, capable of enduring all evil and all good, and always keep our feet on the upward way and pursue justice with wisdom. So we shall be at peace with the Gods and ourselves, both in our life here and when like the victors in the games collecting their prizes, we receive our reward; and both in this life and in the 1000 year journey which I have describe ALL WILL BE WELL WITH US

QUIZ

BOOKS VI-IX PLATO'S REPUBLIC

The purpose of this exam is to give an account of Republic 473d Divide your presentation into 4 parts (1) What is the context of the passage? (2) Describe the character of the philosopher and the reasons presented by Socrates for why this character is not often seen in real life (3) Give an account of what the philosopher is suppose to know by describing the relationships among the Simile of the sun, the divided line and the allegory of the cave (4) show how what the philosopher is suppose to know is related to the educational program Socrates sets out for the philosopher. You are also asked to provide a summary account of Plato's

description of the decay of the philosophical character as described in Book IX. What conclusion is reached at the end of this discussion and in what way does it related to the question posed by Glaucon and Adeimantus at the beginning of the discussion

PLEASE NOTE THAT THE COURSE WENT FROM HERE TO A DISCUSSION OF THE *CATEGORIES AND THEN TO A COMMENTARY ON THE FIRST THREE CHAPTERS OF BOOK I OF *RHETORIC. THE MATERIALS ON CATEGORIES WAS PUT INTO IN MY BIG BLUE COPY BOOK. WHAT I WILL DO IS MAKE A COMMENTARY ON RHETORIC READINGS IN THE BLUE NOTEBOOK AS WELL. THIS IS SO I CAN SUPPLEMENT THEM WILL ADDED READINGS FROM *TOPICS AND *PRIOR ANALYTICS

What I think I shall do is to create a beginning text in ancient political philosophy a I go ,grounded on these readings. I shall need to include *Statesman* as a supplement to Republic and as a transition to Aristotle's *Organon*, which in turn is the preliminary to the study of rhetoric the essential tool for investigating the character of ethics and politics. From there to the ethics and from there to Politics with the idea of using this narrative as a means for commenting on the nominalistic turn in modern politics. This study would be different in that it incorporates extended references to the character of public speaking as the means for sustaining community. Further you might also think about using several of the dialogues concerning the virtues of Piety, Friendship, and Courage along with the Apology for and against. These would be the beginning of public discourse about the manner in which to think about virtues and their public consequences. The critical point of introduction to ancient political philosophy is thus not philological or textual but typological You are seeking trophes; ways of thinking about the nature range and character of social life. The emphasis is upon speech, discourse as speech and discourse impacts upon both ethics and politics

